

a ring of authenticity: it shows affinity with the opening section of a recently published homily by Jacob ('On the Finding of the Cross and on Empress Helena', in R. Akhrass and I. Syryany, *160 Unpublished Homilies of Jacob of Serugh*, vol. I [Damascus, 2017], pp. 200-208) and it shares with Jacob the typical phrase 'cross of light' (*mäsqälä bərhan = šlib nuhrā*); one wonders whether an Arabic model may have existed. For Chrysostom's homily on the cross (no. 6) recent editions and studies are available on the Syriac, Arabic, and Nubian versions, see M. Geerard and J. Noret, *Clavis Patrum Graecorum. Supplementum* (Turnhout, 1998), no. 4525. The larger movement of transmission and transformation of early Christian traditions by way of Syriac and Arabic into Ethiopic also has received renewed scholarly attention, see, e.g., A.M. Butts, 'Embellished with Gold. The Ethiopic Reception of Syriac Biblical Exegesis', *Oriens Christianus* 97 (2013/2014), pp. 137-159.

In addition to giving students and scholars a wealth of new texts, this volume, therefore, also stands out as an open invitation and as a strong encouragement for further study and exploration of the religious literature and traditions of Ethiopian Christians.

Lucas Van Rompay ('s-Hertogenbosch)

Sergij Bulgakov, *Aus meinem Leben; autobiographische Zeugnisse*. Werke Bd. 2, Barbara Hallensleben and Regula Zwahlen (eds.). Münster, Aschendorff Verlag, 2017, 280 pp. ISBN 978-3-402-12036-1; hardcover € 42.

Regula M. Zwahlen, Ksenija Babkova, *Sergij Bulgakov, Bibliographie; Werke, Briefwechsel und Übersetzungen. Mit ausgewählter Sekundärliteratur und einem tabellarischen Lebenslauf*. Werke Bd. 3. Münster, Aschendorff Verlag, 2017, 150 pp. ISBN 978-3-402-12038-5; hardcover € 32.

As part of an ongoing project to make available in German translation the works of the well-known economist, philosopher, theologian, priest and politician Sergij [Sergei] Bulgakov (1871-1944), a translation of his *Autobiograficheskie zametki* along with a number of related texts, as well a bibliography of primary and secondary sources have been published by Barbara Hallensleben and Regula Zwahlen, assisted by Elke Kirsten and Ksenija Babkova, as volume 2 and 3 respectively of his *Werke*. Like volume 1, which consisted of a German translation of one of Bulgakov's main texts, *Filosofija khozhajstva* (2014) [see my review in: JECS 2015], these volumes, too, have been edited with great scrutiny and care, making them an important resource for years to come. The almost complete lack of typos and mistakes makes it hard to be critical of the editorial work; the most serious problem, to my mind, is that it remains unclear who is the author of the interesting analysis of Mikhkail Nesterov's well-known painting of Bulgakov and his close friend Pavel Florensky. It is to be hoped that this edition will continue to appear in the same speed and reach completion in the foreseeable future.

Why is it important to make Bulgakov's works better available? One reason is, of course, the intrinsic interest of this great mind (and person), who is widely regarded as one of the most important Orthodox Christian theologians, but whose work, as part of the current of so-called 'Russian Religious Philosophy' (to which also belonged Vl. Solov'ev, Nikolaj Berdjajev, Semen Frank, Pavel Florenskij, and others), is also of

great interest to philosophers and historians of ideas. Another reason, however, is of a more historical nature: due to Bulgakov's forced emigration, in 1922, from the Soviet Union, and to the fact that during the Soviet period he was *anathema* in Russia, there is to date no full, critical edition of his works, not even in Russian. Therefore, the project under way of a German translation fills a gap not only in German, but in fact in global academic literature. Because of Bulgakov's significance as a world intellectual, it is important that his position is established not only within the context of Russian academia.

What makes Bulgakov interesting and inspiring, well beyond his indisputable and well-documented importance as an Orthodox theologian, is, I would suggest, his intellectual *seriousness*: the fact that he consistently relates to himself and to his experience both personally and theoretically. This comes to the fore in what, to this reviewer's mind, perhaps constitutes the highlights of this book: Bulgakov's 'travel stories' about his visit to Istanbul / Constantinople / Byzantium, or, in Bulgakov's understanding, Tsargrad, about his second visit to Dresden in 1924, and about his 1934 fund-raising trip of more than two months to the USA. In Istanbul in 1923, Bulgakov scrutinized his thoughts while visiting the Hagia Sophia. While deploring the removal of its altar and decorations when the church was transformed into a mosque, Bulgakov shows himself remarkably critical of Slavophile claims (including the claim) to reconquer the 'Second Rome': for him, the Hagia Sophia is 'the universal and absolute church' (p.100), but will regain its position only *after* the reunification of the Christian churches; until then, the devotion of the Muslims who pray in the mosque, and who Bulgakov qualifies as 'placeholders [*Statthalter*]' (ibid.) can only be admired. What strikes the reader most is Bulgakov's awareness of his own changing views: 'Wie unerträglich sind mir alle Varianten eines unverantwortlichen Slavophilentums *geworden* [How unbearable have all variants of irresponsible slavophilism *become* to me]!' (p.105; italics mine, EvdZ). Similarly, when paying his second visit to Rafael's *Sistine Madonna* in the Zwinger gallery in Dresden, he analysed the contrast with his *first* visit in 1898 (described in *Svet necechernyj* and here included p.57 and p.107), when his encounter with the same painting played a crucial role in his transition from Marxist materialism and atheism to idealism and Orthodox Christianity. What then functioned as a mystical vision of Sophia, now, in this exemplar of self-deconstruction, takes the shape of a profound critique of Renaissance painting as humanistic and sinful, displaying 'male sensuality... and desire,' and as inappropriate: 'Diese hier so unangemessene und schockierende Erotik macht die Seele des Bildes aus [This so inappropriate and shocking eroticism forms the soul of the painting]' (p.111). However, rather than rejecting his earlier experience Bulgakov interprets it as part of his gradual transformation: 'mein sicherer religiöser Instinkt erblickte hinter dem Tragischen schon das Religiöse [my confident religious instinct already perceived the religious beyond the tragic]' (p.114).

Bulgakov shows himself consistent in his 'sophiological' reading of his own biography. When travelling to the USA, the Atlantic Ocean and the Niagara Falls strike him as 'a natural element before the first day of creation' and as 'a vision of the Divine Sophia in her powerful chaotic element' (p.132). Fascinating is his day-to-day report of his exhausting travels in the USA and Canada, a report which shows him impressed by the grandiosity of everything American and disturbed by the childishness and naïveté of many of his interlocutionaries (p.125), but which impresses by Bulgakov's openness and

energy as well as by the fact that he, at the age of 63 and despite his chronic insomnia, gave his lectures in English (p.123).

The book also provides new material for the long-standing discussion, discussed in a lengthy footnote (p.232-234, n.14), of Bulgakov's assumed anti-Semitism. His support of anti-Nazi resistance is beyond dispute, as is his general rejection of Nazism; also his alleged summoning anti-Jewish pogroms has been refuted (p.233). At the same time, it is shocking to see how a person who involuntarily left the USSR on a steamer in 1922 (p.96; the investigation file of the Soviet police has been very rightly included!), notes, twelve years later, on his way to the USA on a swastika-adorned German steamer, that the 'Jewish travellers' who surround him create the impression of 'the matter-of-fact conquest of the world by Israel [die faktische Eroberung der Welt durch Israel]' (p.116) – even if Bulgakov states that he will not trust his first impressions (ibid.), to suggest that Jews moving from Germany to America in 1934 on a Nazi steamer are travellers on their way to world conquest is, to say the least, a *chutzpah*. Already in 1933, after the Nazi government started 'freeing' civil service from non-Aryans, thousands of Jewish Germans decided to leave.

What perhaps explains the contrast between sympathy and ignorance is Bulgakov's rather schematic essentialism (not unlike that of his predecessor Vl. Solov'ëv): the very idea that there is such a thing as 'the Jew' or 'the Russian' to begin with. However, when looking at the collected texts as a whole, what saves Bulgakov is his permanent self-critical search for truth. This, more than anything else, makes his writings as inspiring as they are informative. Anyone who reads this book obtains a multifaceted and lasting picture of one of the great intellectuals of the 20th Century, even if to qualify him as 'the most learned man in the world' (p.125) may have been a Yankee exaggeration. The texts span his life from his birth and his baptism in the St Sophia church in Livny (p.9) until his illness (throat cancer) in 1939. This illness appeared fatal, but he unexpectedly recovered, even regaining his voice – thus once again showing his physical strength (p.144) which contrasts with his self-ascribed 'weakness of character' (p.92, among others). The texts also reflect his attempt to restore the content of the lost autobiography that he wrote in 1918-1919 (p.1 and p.29, n.1).

The second book under review is, from a scholarly point of view, just as important as the first, even if it is a less exciting read. It contains a full bibliography of editions and translations (into thirteen languages), as well as selective bibliography of secondary literature (in six languages: Russian, German, English, French, Italian, and Spanish). Surely, this outstanding bibliography, especially of secondary literature, and particularly of a thinker as prolific, diverse, and difficult to 'situate' as is S. Bulgakov, is in need of frequent updates. In that sense, a book like this will be outdated the moment it appears. In this case, however, it is fair to state that anybody who aims to do research on an aspect of Bulgakov's life and thought, can use this book for the period up to 2017, and probably does not have to look any further back, as it also builds upon the two main earlier bibliographies (Naumov 1984 and Akulinin 1996). For publications from 2017 onwards, the attached website at the university of Fribourg, Switzerland, is a reliable source: <http://fns.unifr.ch/sergij-bulgakov>. Bibliography and website, moreover, are easily accessible and usable also for those who have only a limited knowledge of German. The tabular biography (pp.137-144), identical with the one included in the other book under review (pp.190-197), facilitates the use enormously, because every single publication

by Bulgakov can immediately be connected to his life and career. Like the materials relating to his life in *Aus meinem Leben* (vol.2), this is a book that should be included in any serious library.

Evert van der Zweerde (Nijmegen)

Ioannes Andrea di Donna (ed.), *Canones Pœnitentiales*, Vol. I-III. Kanonika 24. Rome: Edizioni Orientalia Christiana and Valore Italiano Editore™/Lilamé, 2017, vol. I: 96 pp., vol. II,1: 912 pp.; vol. I,2: 336 pp., vol. III: 864 pp. € 290 ISBN 978-88-97789-38-3

The subject of ecclesiastical penal legislation is relevant for many disciplines: not only for canon law but also for liturgy, religious popular culture and ethics (crimes, magic, nutrition habits, sexual behaviour ...). Hence, when a new weighty study – in three, even four volumes – on medieval penal codes appeared, it drew my attention. The author of this bulky edition, Gianandrea Di Donna (b. 1965), is a priest of the diocese of Padua and a liturgist who teaches Roman-rite worship in Padua and Byzantine-rite worship in Rome. His study is based on his doctoral dissertation defended *summa cum laude* at PIO in 2004, Prof. Miguel Arranz (1930-2008) having been the supervisor. An Italian bank, Intesa Sanpaolo, has borne the lion's share of the expenses of this costly work. No trouble or expense seems to have been spared for the publication of these handsome volumes. Nevertheless, in spite of their impressive appearance and fine layout, both a first and a second reading have led me to some critical remarks. I would like to offer the following observations and reflections:

The overwhelming majority of the sources published in Di Donna's voluminous work are Latin medieval ones, most of them being already well-known to researchers, and only three texts are Greek (two) and Old Slavonic (one). So, one might ask why the Pontifical Oriental Institute (PIO), which aims to the study of the *Eastern* traditions across all disciplines, published this work. The author/editor provides the answer himself: his goal is a comparison between the diverse traditions, here the Latin, Greek and Slavonic ones. Such comparison will make it possible to see their differences, similarities and divergent pastoral solutions, and eventually to develop a liturgical-canonical theology based on the sources. Di Donna wishes to ground himself in the *liturgia comparativa* (following Anton Baumstark's *liturgie comparée*), in which PIO professors, especially the Jesuits Juan Mateos (1917-2003), Miguel Arranz and Robert Taft (b. 1932), have played such an important role. It is self-evident for such an undertaking that the sources that are to be compared with one another are well edited and that the comments are accurate. In this vital respect, unfortunately, the work in question is highly problematic. Here, I will concentrate on the three *Eastern* texts, which are crucial for the comparative investigations, that is, the two Greek ones and the Slavonic one: the *Protokanonarion* (vol. III, pp. 701-742), the *Deuterokanonarion* (III, pp. 785-810) and the *Euchologion Sinaiticum* (pp. 837-841), as well as their Latin translations (III, pp. 743-783, 811-835 and 843-846 respectively).

Di Donna bases his Greek texts on those published in an earlier volume in the Kanonika series: Miguel Arranz, *I penitenziali bizantini: Il Protokanonarion o Kanonarion Primitivo di Giovanni Monaco o Diacono e il Deuterokanonarion o "Secondo Kanon-*